Hiring and/or Admissions Policies for the University of Toronto and Royal Ontario Museum

This is what was found by UofT and ROM Pod at the University of Toronto and Royal Ontario Museum on Hiring and/or Admissions Policies, as well as what the pod would propose to change and improve.

What EEO (Equal Employment Opportunity) statement is included in a standard job or admissions advertisement? Are there other inclusion statements and resources publicly available?

UofT

Main Employment Page
"DIVERSITY
The University of Toronto is strongly committed to diversity within its community and especially welcomes applications from racialized persons / persons of colour, women, Indigenous / Aboriginal People of North America, persons with disabilities, LGBTQ2S+ persons, and others who may contribute to the further diversification of ideas."

"WORKPLACE INCLUSION
At U of T, we all play an important role in furthering the University's mission to foster an academic community in which learning and scholarship flourish. Working together, we are committed to building an intentionally inclusive environment that engages, supports and empowers all members of our diverse community. We thrive when our community reflects the diversity of our global city.

The principles of equity, diversity and inclusion (EDI) are embedded in everything we do. The University works to advance equity in recruitment, hiring, retention, and training of faculty and staff as well as develop programs that engage under-represented communities across all three campuses.

The University of Toronto is strongly committed to diversity within its community and especially welcomes applications from racialized persons / persons of colour, women, Indigenous / Aboriginal People of North America, persons with disabilities, LGBTQ2S+ persons, and others who may contribute to the further diversification of ideas.

As part of your application, you will be asked to complete a brief Diversity Survey. This survey is voluntary. Any information directly related to you is confidential and cannot be accessed by search committees or human resources staff. Results will be aggregated for institutional planning purposes. For more information, see our FAQs.

For more information about equity, diversity and inclusion at the University of Toronto, please visit the Division of HR & Equity website."

Specific Job Advertisement
"Diversity Statement
The University of Toronto is strongly committed to diversity within its community and especially welcomes applications from racialized persons / persons of colour, women, Indigenous / Aboriginal People of North America, persons with disabilities, LGBTQ2S+ persons, and others who may contribute to the further diversification of ideas.

Accessibility Statement
The University strives to be an equitable and inclusive community, and proactively seeks to increase diversity among its community members. Our values regarding equity and diversity are linked with our unwavering commitment to excellence in the pursuit of our academic mission.

The University is committed to the principles of the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act (AODA). As such, we strive to make our recruitment, assessment and selection processes as accessible as possible and provide accommodations as required for applicants with disabilities.

If you require any accommodations at any point during the application and hiring process, please contact uoft.careers@utoronto.ca."

Admissions
"Diversity, Our Strength.
Rigorous, innovative scholarship thrives only in spaces that embrace the broadest range of people, no matter their race, gender identity, orientation, faith, health, age, origins, or income. These values enhance the University of Toronto's academic mission and enable the discoveries that are our common heritage. Diversity is a mark of quality and a source of strength.

The University of Toronto is committed to dismantling barriers that hold anyone back from their full potential. On all of our campuses, we strive to recruit students who reflect Canada's mosaic and can enrich our community with a breadth of viewpoints and lived experiences."

ROM

Main Employment Page
"The ROM is an equal opportunity employer. Museum jobs are diverse and range from computer programmers to graphic designers, from teachers to curators. Each position carries its own unique requirements regarding education and experience.

The ROM occasionally has job opportunities open to the public, and available positions are posted on this Web page. If you do not see a posting in your area of interest, the Museum does accept general resumes for consideration. The Museum will retain your resume and cover letter for a period of 6 months.

The ROM is committed to fair and accessible employment practices. Upon request, suitable accommodations are available under the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act (AODA) for applicants invited to an interview."

Specific Job Advertisement
"At the ROM, we consider equity, diversity, and inclusivity to be foundational to our institutional success. We seek to foster a workplace that reflects [the full breadth of] the communities we

serve and welcome applications from women, racialized persons/BIPOC, Indigenous/Aboriginal People of North America, LGBTQ2S+, and people with disabilities.

The ROM is committed to fair and accessible employment practices. Upon request, suitable accommodations are available under the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disability Act (AODA) to applicants invited to an interview**."**

Where are advertisements posted or sent? Are there other strategies for reaching applicants for hiring and/or admissions, e.g. job fairs, showcases?

UofT

General admissions and career opportunities are posted within respective locations on the main university website and advertisements on social media. Advertisements for graduate positions can often be heard through word-of-mouth, on social media platforms, or general/specific positions available on lab websites. Occasionally positions are advertised through professional societies and during conferences, but typically communications are through particular networks (e.g. supervisors contact their colleagues/friends to "exchange" students) rather than wide-reaching advertisements or targeting diverse applicants. For general admissions, UofT outlines a number of programs for minority groups to encourage experiencing university life and education/research opportunities, but these are typically targeting high school students considering next career steps. A few of these programs target elementary school students to start this potential trajectory earlier.

Outreach Programs for racialized minorities (Admissions):
https://future.utoronto.ca/university-life/equity-outreach-support/outreach-program/

There is a program to encourage international graduate students to work on projects at UofT and contribute to the academic environment, however there is no financial support from the university for accommodations, immigration, travel, or incidental fees (approximately $800) to the School of Graduate Studies/UofT. Students do not get transfer credits/cannot enroll in courses (but can audit), are primarily supervised by their home institution, and have to be enrolled already in a graduate program to participate. The students are essentially providing free labour to be associated with UofT and it's prestige. "The program ensures that visiting students have a defined legal relationship with the University, and secures them access to Student Life programs and services, University resources (libraries and information technology) and health coverage". However, any university is eligible to send students, provided a supervisor at UofT is willing to supervise their project. There is no information about program success, demographics, which countries/institutions participate, or what participants have gained from this experience suggesting a potential risk for BIPOC without external financial support or savings.   https://www.sgs.utoronto.ca/admissions/international-students/international-visiting-graduate-students/

Recruitment events or targeted outreach for diverse graduate students do not appear to be available. There is a calendar for events where representatives present opportunities outside of the university, but there are currently no opportunities listed and no record of previous events to determine how broadly the opportunities are advertised.

Policy on Academic Appointments
"The position should be advertised widely in such journals as University Affairs and the CAUT Bulletin as well as in national and international journals in the discipline concerned and other appropriate periodicals. Advertisements must also be sent to all the corresponding divisions or departments in other Canadian universities. The objective of wide advertisement is to ensure that the position is drawn to the attention of as many potential candidates as possible in order to increase the chances that the names of the best possible candidates will appear on the list of those to be considered."

ROM

Career opportunities are posted on the main website if posted externally. If in accordance with the position's relevant collective agreement, some positions may only be posted internally. External job advertisements are sometimes advertised locally, nationally, and/or internationally and may be shared on Twitter and other social media through personal/lab accounts of employees. However, there are not to our knowledge any guidelines used by the Human Resources Coordinator to advertise in venues that may attract diverse candidates.

What are the requirements for an applicant, e.g. letters of recommendations, fees/test scores/grades? Is providing any of these a potential barrier that could be further lowered or removed? Are there any problematic questions asked?

UofT

UofT Admissions (Geoscience Bachelor)

Ontario Secondary School Diploma + Six 4U/M courses, including: Biology (SBI4U) is recommended; Calculus & Vectors (MCV4U); Chemistry (SCH4U); English (ENG4U); Physics (SPH4U) is recommended

If English is not your first language (i.e. is not the first language you learned at home as a child), you will need to provide evidence of adequate English facility for admission consideration, unless you qualify for an exemption.

Approximate Admission Range: Low to mid 80s

UofT Admissions (Master of Applied Science Dept Civil & Mineral Engineering)

An undergraduate degree, equivalent to a four year University of Toronto degree, with a minimum GPA (calculated from the final full time year of Bachelor study) of:mid-B average (3.0/4.0 or 75%)

If you have studied for at least 2 years (full-time) towards a degree program, in a country where English is the official first language (for example Canada, U.S.A, Australia or Britain) you may be exempt from the English Facility requirement.

Application: Scanned transcripts; $120 Application Fee; Research Statement; Resume; 2 References (online form); 3 research areas of interest

UofT Careers *Need an account to view application requirements
Administrative assistant:
University Degree/College Diploma Business Management + 3 years experience working with senior business management

Lab Tech: Bachelor degree + 2 years experience in relevant lab work

Tenure track faculty (e.g. Mathematics):
Application materials: cover letter, curriculum vitae, a list of publications, a research statement, a teaching dossier (including a teaching statement, sample syllabi, and teaching evaluations), the AMS Standard Cover Sheet, and at least four letters of reference

"Applicants must have a Ph.D. in Mathematics or a closely related field, and a clearly demonstrated exceptional record of excellence in research and teaching. We seek exceptional candidates who would complement and broaden our existing strengths, see https://www.utsc.utoronto.ca/cms/faculty-of-mathematics. They must have an established international reputation, have sustained over several years a record of research excellence at the highest level internationally, and will be expected to maintain and lead an outstanding, innovative, competitive, independent and externally funded research program at that level.

Excellence in research will be demonstrated by a record of sustained and impactful contributions and publications in top ranked mathematics journals, the submitted research statement, presentations at significant conferences, distinguished awards and accolades, and other noteworthy activities that contribute to the visibility and prominence of the discipline, as well as strong endorsements by referees of top international stature.

Evidence for excellence in teaching must be provided through teaching accomplishments, a record of innovative curriculum development, a sustained record of graduate supervision, strong letters of reference, and a teaching dossier (including a teaching statement, sample syllabi, and strong teaching evaluations) submitted as part of the application. Candidates must also show evidence of a commitment to equity, diversity, inclusion, and the promotion of a respectful and collegial learning and working environment demonstrated through the application materials."

ROM

Communication Coordinator: 3 years post-secondary degree in communications or equivalent work experience (unspecified what that is) + 3 years experience; no application materials specified

Curator Contract: PhD in related field; cover letter, CV, 3 references (contact info only)

How are applicants/applications evaluated? Is that process and/or rubric public? What kind of biases are introduced in this process and what strategies are used to address these, e.g. removing applicant names?

UofT

Search committee policy: https://www.provost.utoronto.ca/planning-policy/search-committee-principles-practices-pdadc-25/
https://www.aapm.utoronto.ca/academic-administrative-procedures-manual/recruitment/#better-practices

Hiring Policy for Academic Appointments
https://governingcouncil.utoronto.ca/system/files/import-files/ppoct3020034713.pdf
"All documentation for candidates must be obtained in writing. The documentation for each candidate should include a current curriculum vitae and several letters of recommendation indicating the candidate's capacity for scholarship as evidenced by teaching and research.

iii) These applications should be assessed and judged by a committee of the division or department which would assist the dean or chair in producing a "short list" of approximately three candidates.

iv) In all divisions the division head should be notified of the Search Committee's recommendation and the reasons for the Committee's selection of the individual over other candidates on the "short list". The division head, if satisfied that an effective search has been made, shall then seek the Provost's approval to authorize the departmental chair in multi-departmental divisions to proceed with the making of a formal offer to the selected candidate. In other faculties, the formal offer to the selected candidate will be made by the head of the division or designate after receiving the Provost's approval. In the case of the appointment of a full professor with tenure, this section is modified by Section II below."

ROM

There are no publicly available policies around the evaluation of applicants. The ROM's Management Practice on Recruitment & Selection, posted internally, states that the "The Selection Committee meets to confirm behavioural performance areas to be evaluated at the interview, to develop technical questions, and to explore any testing options if applicable i.e. testing for bilingual skills, technical computer abilities etc. The Human Resources Coordinator consolidates all questions into an Interview Plan and schedules interviews with candidates. A

post-interview meeting with the Selection Committee should take place to discuss candidate ranking and rationale." We could not find any specific information that would allow us to assess potentially introduced biases.

No specific information about questions or barriers during the interview process were available for either institution. However, from personal experience of pod members, candidates for some faculty positions were assessed heavily on their potential to integrate into the "collegial environment" which focused on social gatherings rather than academic qualifications, risk level (known vs. unknown candidate), and communication (often ESL candidates with heavier accents were deemed less approachable or less desirable "off the record"). Barriers surrounding the job advertisement that could prevent applications from diverse applicants are primary focus on research output (publications) in top journals of the candidates field that "must be" exceptional, preferences given to Canadian and permanent residents without clear conditions in which others could hold that position, vague statements about diversity and inclusion in the job posting or at the institution, reputation of the department and lack of diversity in the department or in previous application pools, lack of targeted recruitment from researchers not associated with UofT/ROM, which don't exhibit high diversity of BIPOC in the departments pod members have experience with. Diversity in the pool is small, and the justification for lack of diversity is that qualified diverse applicants do not apply. The main barriers exist before the application/interview process.

Who is on selection committees and who makes the final decisions? Who interacts with the applicants?

UofT
Faculty Hire
The search committee is made up of faculty members within or among the hiring department(s) and one graduate representative (from personal experience of pod members in our department). The chair of the search committee interacts with applicants formally and a final decision is made by consensus within this committee. During the interview process, the applicants interact more broadly with faculty members and students during a series of faculty- and student-led meetings/events, and feedback about the interaction and the applicant's qualifications are forwarded to the hiring committees.

ROM
Once an Employment Requisition Form has been approved by the relevant Vice President, Chief Operating Officer, and the Executive Director, Finance, the Human Resources Coordinator and Department Head or Manager meet. At this point the membership of the Selection Committee is determined (if needed); however, there is no available information regarding criteria for Selection Committee membership. At minimum, the Human Resources Coordinator, Department Head or Manager, and members of the Selection Committee interact with applicants, though there may be further interaction with other members of the ROM community, for example at a candidate's research presentation.

Has your hiring and/or admissions process been evaluated by outside consultants? What is the process for changing it?

UofT

"(6) Role of a Search Consultant

Most searches can proceed expeditiously and effectively without engaging an external search consultant. However, a search consultant may be particularly helpful when there are special challenges in the scope of the search, profile of the position, types of candidates to be approached, or anticipated pool of applicants. Ideally, the search committee should define and agree upon the role of a search consultant in advance of engaging the firm. In some circumstances, time constraints, cost considerations, and RFP processes may render it necessary to engage a firm in advance of the committee's first meeting. Nonetheless,early role clarification is important. Depending on the committee's needs in particular searches, the specifics of the consultant's role will vary. Normally, a search consultant or firm will play the role of advisor and provide support to the search committee. A consultant must not diffuse the responsibility and accountability of the committee members — which is to recommend or to select the best and most appropriate candidate for the position.

In order to fulfil the mandate defined by the committee, the search consultant will also be required to adhere to any set of working principles or charter of expectations espoused by the committee."

Hiring processes/policies for faculty and librarians can be amended during union negotiations between UofT and University of Toronto Faculty Association (UTFA), which is an independent advocate for these employees. UTFA acts as a confidential buffer between employees and UofT to communicate grievances related to terms and conditions of employment of faculty and academic librarians who are members of UTFA and provide support and resources for impacted individuals.
https://www.utfa.org/content/what-we-do

ROM

The ROM has developed a Multi Year Accessibility Plan (2016) that includes statements about establishment of Diversity and Inclusion committees and policies to make the ROM more accessible. However, the document largely incorporates policies surrounding the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act (2005) and has few actionable items surrounding EDI barriers. The Plan is to review whenever critical information is updated (pertaining to disability accessibility in AODA), or every 5 years. References to the Diversity and Inclusion Accessibility Advisory Committee, formerly Accessibility Advisory Committee, have no mention of diversity beyond individuals with disabilities, little information on hiring practices, and leans to public engagement rather than employees and volunteers. The only audit refers to a disability audit directly linked to the Customer Service Standard.

"Ongoing development of a Diversity and Inclusion Strategy that will lead the Museum to identify and address barriers within organizational systems; create policies, practices, procedures, programs and services that meet the diverse needs of those we serve; and attract and retain a talented workforce skilled at working in an inclusive and respectful manner with one another and with the community"

"In addition, the ROM provides training to employees and volunteers on Ontario's accessibility laws and on the Human Rights Code as it relates to people with disabilities as per the ROM Abuse, Harassment & Discrimination Policy and its Management Practice on Workplace Abuse, Harassment &Discrimination."

https://www.rom.on.ca/sites/default/files/imce/policies2017/accessibility2017.pdf
https://www.rom.on.ca/sites/default/files/imce/romaccessibilitycompliancereport2019.pdf

Has your university or company implemented or considered strategies like cohort hiring, mentoring, dual career support and partner hires, re-visioning your work culture, or other considerations outlined in "Leveraging Promising Practices"?

UofT

To support recruitment efforts, the University has developed employment assistance services for spouses and partners seeking positions inside and outside of academia. Eligibility is restricted to the spouses and partners of newly appointed permanent faculty members (with contracts of three years or more in duration) relocating from beyond the Greater Toronto Area. https://www.aapm.utoronto.ca/academic-administrative-procedures-manual/recruitment/#spouse

ROM

Based on the experience of pod members, employees at the curatorial level have been able to negotiate spousal hires through their association with UofT. We assume that this process solely involves UofT, but spousal hires (in all cases, women) never advanced beyond Research Associate/Assistant Professor status.

Pod Recommendations

1) Abolish "fit" in the interview process, as this typically leans heavily on "likeability" during social events (realized or anticipated) rather than academic qualifications and skills associated with the job description. Instead, we propose the use of specific measures of interpersonal skills and other quantitative assessments to determine which candidate would most improve the

community. Factors could include potential or existing collaborations that could benefit the department and experience inside and outside of academia (e.g. public outreach).

2) Develop and implement a robust rubric to assess qualifications that minimizes the risk of candidates being arbitrarily rejected based on biased views

3) Hiring committees, or individuals who could serve on these committees, should be provided in advance with resources and training tools to assess and acknowledge potential bias and how this could affect their contributions to the committee. External individuals or the committee chair should determine if that training has been satisfactorily completed and understood or that resources have been fully read before the participation in the meeting occurs.

4) A better onboarding plan for both graduate students and faculty/staff. A more informative orientation which transitions to lab specific onboarding, with follow-up to ensure that this has occurred. This is sometimes available at a department level.

5) Encourage faculty to incorporate external factors that could impact productivity into a letter of recommendation as a positive measure. Many individuals fall short of academic expectations because a portion of their time, energy, and/or resources are diverted to pursuits outside of academia (e.g. public outreach, volunteering, advocacy, community building enterprises) or overcoming direct barriers to academic productivity (e.g. poor mentorship for BIPOC, lack of resources, discrimination)

6) Expectations/job descriptions must be clear, and information on how different components of experience and skills are valued in the context of hiring/admissions should be available. Without this information, individuals who do not possess high "traditional" levels of productivity or are missing what are deemed as key qualifications may not apply despite excelling in their field or in other areas/skills that would be beneficial to the institution.

7) Committees should be diverse if possible, however departments tend to have few BIPOC individuals, and management should be mindful of not tokenizing or overburdening these individuals.