



Hiring and/or Admissions Policies for University/Organization

This is what was found by the Cardiff University URGE pod on Hiring and/or Admissions Policies, as well as what the pod would propose to change and improve (blue points).

Undergraduate Admissions

- **What EEO (Equal Employment Opportunity) statement¹ is included in a standard job or admissions advertisement? Are there other inclusion statements and resources publicly available²?**

There is an EEO statement located under the admissions policy tab (<https://www.cardiff.ac.uk/public-information/students-applicants/admissions-policies>) that is available via a link from a specific course. Currently there is no EEO statement on the specific course application websites. This includes links to a statement of widening participation (<https://www.cardiff.ac.uk/about/our-profile/who-we-are/university-for-all/widening-access>) and for contextual admission (<https://www.cardiff.ac.uk/study/undergraduate/applying/contextual-data>).

- **Where are advertisements posted or sent? Are there other strategies for reaching applicants for hiring and/or admissions, e.g. job fairs, showcases?**

Advertising of undergraduate degrees occurs through a centralised team who manage an online and social media presence (supported by School level online and social media activities), there are also external showcase events (e.g. Grangetown Community Gateway, Soapbox Science, Pint of Science), and through online and University open days and post-offer visit days.

- **What are the requirements for an applicant, e.g. letters of recommendations, fees/test scores³/grades? Is providing any of these a potential barrier that could be further lowered or removed? Are there any problematic questions asked?**

Applications are managed within a centralised University team based on a UK-wide system called the Universities and Colleges Admissions Service (UCAS). This service costs £20 or a

¹ R. Kelley, 10 Samples of an Effective EEO Statement, blog.ongig.com/diversity-and-inclusion/eeo-statement-samples, (2017).

² <https://careers.who.edu/opportunities/diversity-inclusion/>

³ K. Cobb, #GRExit Resources, <https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.13215461.v1>, (2020).

⁴ J. Posselt, Inside Graduate Admissions: Merit, Diversity, and Faculty Gatekeeping, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctvjghw8s>, (2016).

⁵ <https://www.brandeis.edu/diversity/dei-recruitment-hiring/rubric-for-evaluating-diversity-statements.html>

⁶ K. Griffin, J. Bennett, T. York, Leveraging Promising Practices, Washington DC: Aspire Alliance, (2020).



Unlearning Racism in Geoscience

single choice and £26 for multiple choices (<https://www.ucas.com/connect/blogs/paying-your-application>)

Applicant requirements are managed within the central university, with criteria that are set by the school. There are multiple pathways to entry (e.g. A-level, Welsh baccalaureate). The current offer in terms of A-level is:

A typical A-level offer requires:

ABB-BBB (with 1 science subject) or BBB-BBC (with 2 science subjects). Acceptable science subjects: Biology, Chemistry, Computer Science, Environmental Science, Geography, Geology, Maths, Physics.

After all initial offers are made, the University may invite applications at a lower offer to reach a targeted number of entries for the course. The process is iterative, with school admissions committees interacting with University admissions committees to decide the correct criteria to reach the targeted number of entries.

All admissions must also meet University English language requirements.

- **How are applicants/applications evaluated? Is that process and/or rubric^{4,5} public? What kind of biases are introduced in this process and what strategies are used to address these, e.g. removing applicant names?**

The process is based on criteria, so is robust in a lot of ways. There is potential for bias during the clearing process, where the criteria can be varied. However, this bias may be in a positive direction as it will potentially include students who are disadvantaged by our current criteria.

- **Who is on selection committees and who makes the final decisions? Who interacts with the applicants?**

Much of the process is automated and centralised. The school has an admissions officer, an academic who is in charge of managing the process and setting the criteria. They report to a Teaching Executive. The central team typically interacts with the students, however the admissions officer or degree scheme leaders may also discuss with students.



Unlearning Racism in Geoscience

- **Has your hiring and/or admissions process been evaluated by outside consultants? What is the process for changing it?**

N/A as this occurs within the central university

PhD Admissions

- **What EEO (Equal Employment Opportunity) statement¹ is included in a standard job or admissions advertisement? Are there other inclusion statements and resources publicly available²?**

Many of our students are recruited through a multi-university consortium called the NERC GW4+ Doctoral Training Partnership. There is a diversity statement on the website, however, there is no statement on the information for applicants page (<https://www.nercgw4plus.ac.uk/apply>).

- **Where are advertisements posted or sent? Are there other strategies for reaching applicants for hiring and/or admissions, e.g. job fairs, showcases?**

Applications are advertised online (e.g. find a PhD), through individual institutions, and through individual research networks.

- **What are the requirements for an applicant, e.g. letters of recommendations, fees/test scores³/grades? Is providing any of these a potential barrier that could be further lowered or removed? Are there any problematic questions asked?**

Graduates in appropriate science subject such as Geology or Environmental Science, with at least a First Class or 2:1 Honours degree, or a master's. Must satisfy the School that they are academically able to complete the research degree programme (Research Degree Regulations). Must also meet minimum University requirements for English language.

- **How are applicants/applications evaluated? Is that process and/or rubric^{4,5} public? What kind of biases are introduced in this process and what strategies are used to address these, e.g. removing applicant names?**

Applications are managed centrally, then individual PhD supervisors are asked to consider the applications and provide a ranked list of potential candidates. These aspects are compared to



Unlearning Racism in Geoscience

widening participation criteria. These candidates are then considered as a pool by an admissions committee composed of at least three academics from all participating schools. There is a strong requirement for EDI balance of the interview panel.

Group suggestions:

- Allocate or target proportion of PhD studentships to BAME candidates, women, etc.
- Ensure all panel members have recently participated in implicit bias training
- **Who is on selection committees and who makes the final decisions? Who interacts with the applicants?**

The selection committee includes the Director of Postgraduate Studies in EARTH, the University designated DTP lead, a representative(s) from EARTH and BIOSI, and an external member of the GW4+ DTP.

- **Has your hiring and/or admissions process been evaluated by outside consultants? What is the process for changing it?**

This process is instituted by the GW4+NERC DTP management board headed by Bristol University, to ensure a coherent selection process across the 4 participating institutions.

Recruitment

- **What EEO (Equal Employment Opportunity) statement¹ is included in a standard job or admissions advertisement? Are there other inclusion statements and resources publicly available²?**

The following text must be included on academic appointments and is encouraged for other appointments (but ultimately up to PI). Standardised text relating to Equality, Diversity and Inclusion are now pre-populated in the e-recruitment system. The following text has been included in recent advertisements:

“The School of Earth and Environmental Sciences is committed to promoting equality and diversity, including the Athena SWAN charter for promoting inclusive working practices in STEMM subjects in higher education. We particularly welcome applications from Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic (BAME) and women candidates as BAME and women are currently under-represented within the School. Appointment will always be made on merit.”



Unlearning Racism in Geoscience

For teaching/research academic positions, the advertisement text must also be processed through an online tool checking for gender or racial bias in language. No such tool is enforced for temporary research positions.

There is a target for one third of applicants to be female. No target currently exists based on ethnicity. Since introducing the gender based target, there has been an increase in gender equality of appointments, with 3/5 female appointed academic staff in 2019-2020. However these 3 appointments were within the School's geography teaching/research themes and no female geoscience appointments have been made since 2004. There are currently no female teaching/research academic staff in the Centre for Solid Earth and Natural Resources.

Group suggestions:

- Ensure this text is also used for all fixed term positions
 - Consider why minority groups are not being successfully targeted for geoscience positions, in particular relative to the more successful (gender based) targeting for geography positions. Consider intersectionality between targeting on the basis of gender and ethnicity.
- **Where are advertisements posted or sent? Are there other strategies for reaching applicants for hiring and/or admissions, e.g. job fairs, showcases?**

Open-ended teaching / research positions

Websites: Earthworks, LinkedIn, typical mainstream career websites

Networks / promoting diversity: WISE and Diversity Woman (network promoting women in STEM)

Social Media: Twitter, LinkedIn (Staff accounts)

Fixed Term Research Positions (PDRA)

Up to the PI / line manager. Typically Earthworks, main-stream career websites, e-mail list services, and sometimes social media.

Group suggestions:

- Promote the advertisement of both fixed term and open ended positions on diversity networks



Unlearning Racism in Geoscience

- **What are the requirements for an applicant, e.g. letters of recommendations, fees/test scores³/grades? Is providing any of these a potential barrier that could be further lowered or removed? Are there any problematic questions asked?**

Applicants for all academic (teaching/research and research only) positions must have references that can provide a letter of recommendation.

- **How are applicants/applications evaluated? Is that process and/or rubric^{4,5} public? What kind of biases are introduced in this process and what strategies are used to address these, e.g. removing applicant names?**

Permanent teaching / research positions

There are scoring matrices (not made public) for the first and second stage interviews. The second matrix does not completely decide the final appointment.

Applicants are evaluated in the following stages:

Shortlisting

- A panel decides on a shortlist of around 10 people

1st stage interviews

- Applicants give a 10 minute presentation and a 30 minute interview
- Interview questions / answers are completely value based, not involving academic performance metrics etc.
- Panel discusses pros / cons of each applicant without ranking or shortlisting. After 24 hours to reflect the panel confidentially email score sheets and opinions to the HoS.
- All interviews are conducted on the same day.
- HoS decides who continues to the 2nd stage, but decision is reviewed by the panel

2nd stage interviews

- Applicants have an informal chat with HoS (not assessed in any way)
- Applicants give a 30 minute presentation to the school, with the first 5 minutes accessible to undergraduates
- An undergraduate representative collects feedback and forwards to HoS
- A staff representative or staff member external to the school collects staff feedback to forward to HoS



Unlearning Racism in Geoscience

- Applicants a second interview, where questions are still mainly values based but can touch on research plans and performance.
- The panel again follow a process of reflecting for 24 hours before sending feedback to the HoS
- Final decision is made by the panel, who come to consensus through a long process of meeting and deliberation potentially lasting 2-3 days

Group suggestions:

- To promote the acceptance of job offers and staff retention, introduce measures specifically aimed at introducing applicants to the School and University to make them feel like they will be welcomed and / fit in (e.g. invitations to school seminars)
- Ensure all panel members have recently participated in implicit bias training
- Consider the influence of panel fatigue during long interview/deliberation processes (i.e. having an entire day of interviews) in introducing bias
- Open every panel meeting with a reminder of the goal/mindset, and encourage all panel members to challenge potential instances of group think.

Fixed Term Research Positions (PDRA)

The process and final decision is up to the line manager / PI. There is no formal scoring matrix. The decision must be based on documented notes. There are no formal processes to reduced bias, aside from guidelines highlighting discriminatory behavior to avoid and general anti-bias training all staff must take. There are no procedures to ensure gender or ethnicity balance / representation in the shortlist. At least one member of the search panel will have taken a training course in how to chair interview panels. This course includes a strong focus on implicit bias training.

Group suggestions:

- Ensure all panel members have recently participated in implicit bias training and read anti-bias interview guidelines on intranet
- Promote panel diversity by including BAME, female and non-research or external staff
- Setting diversity targets for applicants
- Open every panel meeting with a reminder of the goal/mindset, and encourage all panel members to challenge potential instances of group think.



Unlearning Racism in Geoscience

- **Who is on selection committees and who makes the final decisions? Who interacts with the applicants?**

Permanent teaching / research positions

Shortlist panel – HoS, director of research, director of learning / teaching, research centre heads

Both interview stages – HoS, director of research, director of learning / teaching, staff with other leadership positions (e.g. director of research) and sometimes a staff member external to the school (always for Grade 7 and above). The panel can change between the interview stages, to gain a range of opinions.

The HoS interacts with applicants, before and during the interview process. Applicants also have opportunities to meet School staff during the second interview stage.

A new measure to be implemented as part of the 'Strategic Equality Plan' will be a university-wide pool of BAME staff volunteers, who will be given the opportunity to join interview panels. Interviews without a BAME staff member will still proceed if there are no volunteers.

Fixed Term Research Positions (PDRA)

Two to three people, completely chosen by the PI / line manager. Guidelines recommend the Head of School and Line Manager, though both can be replaced by a 'nominated representative'. The third interviewer is another staff member senior to the post and must be an administrative staff for administrative or technical roles and external to the school for teaching and research or management positions. The recruiter is the PI / line manager.

- **Has your hiring and/or admissions process been evaluated by outside consultants? What is the process for changing it?**

The university is currently implementing the 'Strategic Equality Plan' in internal consultation with the Race Equality Steering Group and staff networks (BAME, Carers and Families, Disability, LGTB+, Welsh language). Unclear that there has been any external consultation.

- **Has your university or company implemented or considered strategies like cohort hiring, mentoring, dual career support and partner hires, re-visioning your work culture, or other considerations outlined in "Leveraging Promising Practices"⁶?**



Unlearning Racism in Geoscience

All staff mentors should be assigned School mentors. The School PDRA network has reported that in practice this isn't always implemented.

Exemplar Job Description (Open-ended T&R)

£33,797 - £40,322 per annum (Grade 6)

Vacancy Number: 10432BR

As part of an on-going programme of investment and development, the School of Earth and Environmental Sciences, Cardiff University is seeking to appoint a lecturer in Geospatial Science.

You should share our passion for high quality research-led teaching and be able to contribute to a range of undergraduate and postgraduate teaching in geospatial science, with a focus on geographic information science (GIS) and spatial data science, and their application to earth and environmental sciences. Willingness to teaching a GIS applications course for non-specialists is strongly desired. You will also supervise MSc and PhD thesis students.

The successful candidate must develop and sustain an internationally recognised, externally funded interdisciplinary research programme in the area(s) of; GIS, spatial analysis of physical earth and environmental processes, spatial statistics, or geo-visualisation - each at scales ranging from the local to global. We are seeking candidates who complement our current research programme and who are able to integrate across existing areas of expertise. Current areas of research interest in the school at large include tectonics and structural geology, natural resource exploration, marine science, climate/environmental change, hydrology and hydrogeology, high-latitude and montane environments, and environmental/geohazards and their impacts.

You will join our lively and dynamic School which is internationally-recognised for its research and teaching. You will have an excellent academic research record, including quality peer-reviewed publications and the proven ability to secure external funding to support your research.

The School of Earth and Environmental Sciences is committed to promoting equality and diversity, including the Athena SWAN charter for promoting inclusive working practices in STEMM subjects in higher education. We particularly welcome applications from Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic (BAME) and women candidates as BAME and women are currently under-represented within the School. Appointment will always be made on merit.

This is a full-time post (35 hours per week). The post is available immediately and is open-ended.

For informal enquiries, please contact Professor Ian Hall, Head of School, Email: EarthHos@cardiff.ac.uk or Dr Jenny Pike, Director of Learning and Teaching, Email: Pikej@cardiff.ac.uk

For further details about working in Cardiff University please contact Briony FitzGerald, email: FitzgeraldB1@cardiff.ac.uk

More information on the School of Earth and Environmental Sciences: <https://www.cardiff.ac.uk/earth-environmental-sciences>

Important Notes:

Applications can only be accepted via the online system.

Closing date: Tuesday 16 February 2021.

This post has previously been advertised to employees of Cardiff University only. We now invite external applications.



Unlearning Racism in Geoscience

Please be aware that Cardiff University reserves the right to close this vacancy early should sufficient applications be received. Cardiff University is committed to supporting and promoting equality and diversity and to creating an inclusive working environment. We believe this can be achieved through attracting, developing, and retaining a diverse range of staff from many different backgrounds who have the ambition to create a University which seeks to fulfil our social, cultural and economic obligation to Cardiff, Wales, and the world. In supporting our employees to achieve a balance between their work and their personal lives, we will also consider proposals for flexible working or job share arrangements.